

# Annex Y

## Guidelines for the Review of Scientific Permit Proposals

Greg Donovan

The Committee has been given a number of guidelines for the review of scientific permit proposals by the Commission. The most recent of these was Resolution 1999-2, the active part of which states:

REQUESTS the Scientific Committee, with respect to all Special Permit Research Programmes, to provide advice to the Commission, on the research to be undertaken pursuant to any proposed Special Permit or that has been undertaken in respect of any Special Permit, as to whether the information sought in the research programme under each Special Permit is:

1. required for the purposes of management of the species or stock being researched; and
2. whether the information sought could be obtained by non-lethal means.

This Annex includes all the Guidelines grouped under five headings, following the approach adopted for the review of the first JARPN proposal (*Rep. int. Whal. Commn* 45: 82ff.)

### (A) The Proposal

The relevant guidelines are as follows:

1. 'A Statement as to whether the permit proposal adequately specifies the four sets of information required under paragraph 30 of the Schedule.' (*Rep. int. Whal. Commn* 36: 133)
2. 'Objectives of the research;' (Sched. Para 30)
3. 'Number, sex, size and stock of the animals to be taken;' (Sched. Para 30)

### (B) Objectives

The relevant guidelines are as follows:

1. 'Comments on the objectives of the research to be carried out under the proposed scientific permit, including in particular how they might relate to research needs identified by the Scientific Committee;' (*Rep. int. Whal. Commn* 36: 133)
2. 'The proposed research is intended and structured accordingly to contribute information essential for rational management of the stock;' (*Rep. int. Whal. Commn* 37: 25)
3. Is 'required for the purposes of management of the species or stock being researched;' (Resolution 1999-2)
4. 'The research addresses a question or questions that should be answered in order to conduct the

comprehensive assessment or to meet other critically important research needs;' (*Rep. int. Whal. Commn* 38: 27-28)

5. 'The number, age and sex of whales to be taken are necessary to complete the research and will facilitate the conduct of the comprehensive assessment;' (*Rep. int. Whal. Commn* 37: 25)

### (C) Methodology

The relevant guidelines are as follows:

1. 'Comments on the methodology of the proposed research and an evaluation of the likelihood that the methodology will lead to achievement of the scientific objectives. These comments may also include evaluation of the methodology in terms of current scientific knowledge;' (*Rep. int. Whal. Commn* 36: 133)
2. 'The objectives of the research are not practically and scientifically feasible through non-lethal research techniques;' (*Rep. int. Whal. Commn* 37: 25)
3. '... whether the information sought could be obtained by non-lethal means;' (Resolution 1999-2)
4. 'The research addresses a question or questions that cannot be answered by analysis of existing data and/or use of non-lethal research techniques;' (*Rep. int. Whal. Commn* 38: 27-28)
5. 'Whales will be killed in a manner consistent with the provisions of Section III of the schedule, due regard being had to whether there are compelling scientific reasons to the contrary;' (*Rep. int. Whal. Commn* 37: 25) [The Commission agreed that it has been intended by this for the Committee to report if cold grenade harpoons were used in special permit catches. (*Rep. int. Whal. Commn* 38: 13)]
6. 'The research is likely to yield results leading to reliable answers to the questions being addressed;' (*Rep. int. Whal. Commn* 38: 27-28)

### (D) Effect of catches on the 'stock'

The relevant guidelines are:

1. 'A review of the most recent information on the stock or stocks concerned, including information on any exploitation, stock analysis and recommendations by the Scientific Committee to date (including, where

appropriate, alternative analyses and conclusions and points of controversy);' (*Rep. int. Whal. Commn 36: 133*)

2. 'An evaluation of the specification in the permit proposal of 'possible effect on conservation of the stock'. As appropriate, the Scientific Committee may carry out its own analysis of the possible effects; (*Rep. int. Whal. Commn 36: 133*)
3. 'The research can be conducted without adversely affecting the overall status and trends of the stock in question or the success of the comprehensive assessment of such stocks;' (*Rep. int. Whal. Commn 38: 27-28*)

#### **(E) Research cooperation**

The relevant guideline is:

1. 'Comment on the adequacy and implications of specified arrangements for participation by scientists of other nations'. (*Rep. int. Whal. Commn 36: 133*)

#### **FORMAT OF THE REPORT**

The format of reporting agreed at that time was that there were two sub-sections under each major grouping: (1) a summary of the view of the proponents of the proposal; and (2) comments and discussion by the full Committee.